

**City of Orting**  
**PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES**  
September 8, 2022

Chair Kelly Cochran called the meeting to order at 7:00pm. Roll call found Commissioners, Chris Rule, Erika Bartholomew, Jennifer McKinney, and Dan Swanson in attendance. A quorum was present.

Commissioner Craig was absent from the meeting. Commissioner Rule moved to excuse Commissioner Craig from the meeting. Commissioner Bartholomew seconded the motion and it carried.

**ATTENDANCE:**

City Planning Commission Secretary Danielle Charchenko, City Clerk Kim Agfalvi.  
City Administrator Scott Larson - Virtual

Professional City Planner Carmen Smith - absent.  
Representatives

Guests (including Virtual Les Seifert – Ronhovde Architects LLC (Virtual)  
Log-in)

**AGENDA APPROVAL:**

Agenda Approval Commissioner McKinney moved to adopt the agenda with addition of “signs on poles in town” to item G-2.  
Commissioner Rule seconded the motion and it carried.

**AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION:** None.

**MINUTES:**

Approval of Minutes for Commissioner McKinney moved to approve the July 7, 2022 minutes as presented.  
July 7, 2022 Commissioner Rule seconded the motion and it carried.

Approval of Minutes for Commissioner McKinney moved to approve the August 1, 2022 minutes as presented.  
August 1, 2022 Commissioner Rule seconded the motion and it carried.

**ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN REVIEW:**

- A. ADR 2022-08 – Fourplex – 215 Corrin Ave NW – Les Seifert.  
Planning Commission Secretary Danielle Charchenko read the ADR staff report for ADR 2022-08 and stated that staff recommendation was approval as presented. Planning Commission discussion followed.

Commissioner Swanson made a motion to approve ADR 2022-08 with the condition that garbage cans must be required to be stored inside garage. Commissioner Rule seconded the motion and it carried.

- B. ADR 2022-09 – Exterior Lighting – 308 Kansas St SW – Chris Rule.  
Chair Cochran stated she went to the Orting Baptist Church earlier in the week to orient herself with the placement of the parking lot lights and briefed that while she was there Commissioner Rule shared a mitigation plan for the light intrusion to the surrounding neighbors. Chair Cochran stated that no assurances of acceptance to the plan Commissioner Rule presented were given. Commissioner Rule agreed that was his understanding of the interaction.



Commissioner Rule recused himself from the meeting at 7:17pm and left the chambers.

Planning Commission Secretary Danielle Charchenko read the ADR staff report for ADR 2022-09 and stated that staff recommendation was approval with the following conditions:

1. Applicant is required to use residence side shields to lessen impact of surrounding neighbors and should make reasonable efforts to mitigate direct visibility of the light emitting portions of the fixtures.
2. Applicant shall use 3K color temperature light setting to achieve a warm tone color and avoid excessive brightness.
3. The two lights on the east side of the property shall be shut off except for when the field is in use and these two lights shall not be on past 10 pm.
4. The directly lit area shall not exceed past the property lines.

Dale Kurty, Orting Baptist Church Pastor, stated in addition to staff report recommendations:

- Light poles will be lowered 10 feet, from 35' to 25'.
- Light heads will be reduced to one light per pole.
- Light heads will be tilted in toward the property with approved shields on each light.
- Reducing the lights to 3,000 Kelvin to meet requirements for Church parking lot brightness in residential areas.

Public Comments:

Cheryl Temple-Kelly residing at 202 Kansas St SW stated most of the neighbors whose properties border the Baptist Church are concerned and upset about the lighting situation. The project appears to have been complete since spring of 2022. Mrs. Temple-Kelly stated the lights have affected some of the neighbors' health and mental well-being. She stated the neighbors are upset that the Church never consulted or asked the neighbors for input because the Church didn't apply for an ADR review until after the project was complete. Mrs. Temple-Kelly provided an example of when Pioneer Village installed lighting and was made to take the lights down and reinstall lights at a height and angle that didn't impact their neighbors' yards. She stated that she is expecting something like this to happen with the Church lighting. Mrs. Temple-Kelly then cited the WA Energy Code stating the lights are to be off from 12am-6am and motion sensors on lights are to shut the lights off 30 minutes after the last activity. Mrs. Temple-Kelly stated the Church's lights are currently on all night long. She also cited Orting's ADR for design stating lighting shall enhance the building design and adjacent landscape. She stated the current lights are large, 30-35 feet above the ground and do not enhance the building design or adjacent landscape. The ADR standards also state it shall be of a design and a size compatible with the design and size of the building and adjacent areas. Mrs. Temple-Kelly stated the lights are so big and bright, they belong in a football stadium, airport, or commercial parking lot and not in a neighborhood. The ADR standards also state early 1900's exterior lighting styles are encouraged. Mrs. Temple-Kelly stated the Church lights are not turn of the century style and requested that the Church's lights fit the neighborhood style.

Barbara Ford residing at 506 Grinnell Ave SW stated that she is located right on the other side of the fence from the Orting Baptist Church. She then stated that she understands the Church's motivation for lighting was for safety and because of crime happening at the Church. Mrs. Ford stated she is sympathetic to the idea of wanting to stop crime, however, as a result of the very tall and intense lights her entire backyard is lit up all night. Mrs. Ford stated that she would like to see some shading so that her property is not as illuminated and would like to see some consideration for neighbors needs as single-family dwellings. Mrs. Ford briefed that her bedroom is on the Church side and that she needed to purchase new black out curtains for her bedroom because it was so bright and stated that even with those installed there is still light that comes through. Mrs. Ford asked for cooperation from the Church to reach a compromise so that she is able to get sleep at night.

John Kelly residing at 202 Kansas St SW cited the Orting City Code stating the neighbors shall not be impacted by lights. He then stated that these lights have had a definite impact. Mr. Kelly briefed that he has tried to work with the pastor and Church and stated his yard is still lit up like a stadium. Mr. Kelly referred to the ADR 2022-09 staff report comparing the Church lights to Safeway, high school, middle school, and elementary school lights. He then stated that the school's lights are exempt from ADR codes but the City Hall building had to follow the City lighting code. City Hall's lights are muted, shielded from the street, are pointing up, and there is very little light emitting outside the building's footprint. Mr. Kelly stated the Church parking lot lights are huge and that he understands the Church wants to reduce the lights to one light per pole and that currently some poles have four lights on them. Mr. Kelly also briefed he would like to see a requirement added for the lights to be off when the building is not occupied. He stated there is no reason for the lights to be on all night, they have security lights on the building that light up the parking area adequately without the large, high poles. Mr. Kelly stated he is aware that they have a field that is used for activities, but would like to see the lights off when the parking lot and field are not occupied.



James Wren residing at 508 Grinnell Ave SW stated he is located right behind the Church and when they installed their lights he was given no warning. Mr. Wren briefed when the lights were being installed he spoke with the contractor and the contractor asked if the neighbors were notified about the lights being installed. Mr. Wren stated when he told the contractor no, they had not be notified, the contractor said he would install shields to block the light. Mr. Wren stated it appeared the shields had not been added because ever since the lights came on he is unable to see the stars at night in his backyard because all he can see is light from the Church property. Mr. Wren briefed he also had to purchase black out curtains, but because the lights are so bright and they are positioned next to his fence, light still shines into his bedroom at night. Mr. Wren asked why these lights have to be on all night and asked that the lights be turned off at night when everyone is gone.

Jorge Martinez residing at 204 Kansas St SW stated he lives directly behind the Church. Mr. Martinez briefed he moved from Brooklyn, New York and has been living in Orting for 7 years. He stated that he is a 15-year disabled veteran of the Marine Corps. and when the lights came on they were on full blast. He decided to reach out to the Church about the lights being so bright and was told the Church was having an issue with theft. Mr. Martinez recommended to the Church that they use dummy cameras and that he could assist with installation if needed. Mr. Martinez then stated he was recently sitting in his backyard in the middle of the night because he was unable to sleep and the lights would go back and forth from dim to full bright all night. He stated that this was happening without any cars in the parking lot which he can clearly see from his deck. Mr. Martinez briefed he contacted the Church again and stated the lights the Church have on the building is enough to light the parking lot. Mr. Martinez stated he has a problem sleeping and also had to purchase blackout blinds because the light shines right through his living room. He noted he had made contact the City of Orting to inform them of the issue.

Ashley Kurty residing at 215 Icey St SW stated her husband is one of the pastors at the Church and wanted to share her perspective as someone who uses the building. Mrs. Kurty stated she appreciates the security the lights have provided as someone who is commonly in the building late into the night. She stated before the lights were installed their property was taken advantage of because they are setback from the road and are unseen by police or anyone passing by and became a place where people congregated. Multiple people have been arrested for petty crimes on the premises and she stated people were doing drugs on the premises and the window to the toddler's nursery had been shattered. She also stated Church vans have been broken into and had the gas syphoned through broken gas lines. She noted they have seen a decrease in crime since the lights were installed. Mrs. Kurty stated that she is hopeful that the changes to mitigate the light out of neighbors' yards will help everyone's situation.

Planning Commission discussion followed.

Commissioner McKinney made a motion to approve ADR 2022-09 with the change to staff recommendation #3; all lights shall not be on past 10pm unless triggered by a motion sensor. Also, adding the condition that lights must be 25' from the ground at installation. Commissioner Bartholomew seconded the motion and it carried (3-1).  
Nay – Commissioner Swanson.

**NEW BUSINESS:**

None

**OLD BUSINESS:**

Dumpster Code Violations                      City Clerk Kim Agfalvi briefed that the City has been in contact with several businesses and other problematic dumpsters and letters have been sent out.

Commissioner Rule rejoined the meeting at 8:23pm

Signage Code Violations                      City Clerk Kim Agfalvi stated Mr. Golen was sent a letter from the city via email and mailed on August 29<sup>th</sup>, 2022 letting him know his temporary sign permit has expired and he has 10 days from the date of the letter to remove the temporary signage from the façade of the building. She stated she has reached out to the code enforcement officer to notify him that as of September 9<sup>th</sup>, 2022 the Shell station sign needs to come down. Planning Commission Secretary Danielle Charchenko stated there is no new progress on the Adult Family Homes signage. Commissioner McKinney requested that "junk signs" (non-city businesses) around town be addressed/removed.

**GOOD OF THE ORDER:**

Planned Absences

None.

Report on Council Meetings

City Clerk Kim Agfalvi gave a brief report and stated the Pierce County Emergency Management team gave a presentation, Council passed a resolution for firearm surplus, and the manufactured homes code amendments passed with the age being no more than 3 years old. Public Safety passed an interlocal agreement with the Puyallup jail to utilize services, renewed an interlocal agreement with the SCORE Jail and renewed an interlocal agreement with the Multijurisdictional Tactical Response Team to add City of DuPont. City Clerk Kim Agfalvi stated the sponsorship for Red Hat Days and the Pumpkin Festival were approved. She briefed that Sound Transit also came out and gave a presentation discussing RTA taxes and timelines for projects that will benefit the City of Orting.

Agenda Setting

The Planning Commission asked that Old Business stay on the agenda for the October Meeting.  
The Planning Commission will have a Public Hearing on the Comprehensive Plan Amendments (2 pieces).  
The Planning Commission will review the Sign Code Amendment ordinance.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

Meeting Adjournment

Commissioner McKinney moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:31pm. Commissioner Swanson seconded the motion and it carried.

**ATTEST:**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Kelly Cochran, Commission Chair

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Danielle Charchenko, Planning Commission Secretary